# KOPELMA: Scientific Journal of Education and Teaching

KOPELMA: Scientific Journal of Education and Teaching

Volume 1 (2) 158 – 166 <mark>December 2024</mark>

The article is published with Open Access at: https://journal.mgedukasia.or.id/index.php/kopelma

# Improving Student Learning Outcomes in Islamic Education Learning Using the Problem Based Learning Model at SMP Negeri 2 Sosa

**Erna Suryani** ⊠, SMP Negeri 2 Sosa, Indonesia **Sarnaida Lubis**, SD Negeri 0603 Tandihat, Indonesia **Nova Yulia**, SMA Negeri Modal Bangsa, Indonesia

⊠ ernasuryani07@guru.smp.belajar.id

**Abstract:** This study aims to improve student learning outcomes in Islamic religious education learning by using the problem based learning model. This study is a classroom action research that uses four steps, namely planning, action, observation and reflection. The subjects of this study were junior high school students. The data for this study were obtained by test and observation techniques. Tests are used to measure learning outcomes and observations are used to analyze teacher and student learning activities. The data analysis technique used in this study is descriptive statistics by comparing the results obtained with indicators of research success. The results of the study indicate that the problem based learning model can improve student learning outcomes in Islamic religious education learning. This can be seen from the increase in the percentage of student learning completion in each cycle with details of the pre-cycle 58.32%, the first cycle 69.19% and in the second cycle it increased to 89.66%. Thus, the use of the problem based learning model can be used as an alternative to improve student learning outcomes in Islamic religious education learning.

Keywords: Problem based learning, learning outcome, islamic education.

Received September 15, 2024; Accepted November 3, 2024; Published December 31, 2024

**Citation**: Suryani, E., Lubis, S., & Yulia, N. (2024). Improving Student Learning Outcomes in Islamic Education Learning Using the Problem Based Learning Model at SMP Negeri 2 Sosa. *KOPELMA: Scientific Journal of Education and Teaching*. 1(2). 158–166.

Published by Mandailing Global Edukasia © 2024.

#### INTRODUCTION

The purpose of education is to help students reach their full potential. Students should not be taught subject matter or told to memorize facts and figures; instead, they should be treated as living beings with potential and developing bodies. Sanjaya (2010), The purpose of education is to shape the attitudes, intelligence, and abilities of students in accordance with the learning objectives. The active involvement of teachers in providing information and practical life skills to students through an effective learning process is one sign that the goals of education have been achieved. The efficiency of student learning activities and teacher instruction is one of the key elements of a successful learning process. The most important factors in maximizing the improvement of the quality of education are teacher effectiveness and student learning.

A number of elements influence how well the learning process takes place. Teachers, learning models, and methods are some of the elements that influence learning outcomes. Therefore, one of the duties and obligations of educators in the classroom is to be involved in activities that improve student learning outcomes. If teachers can demonstrate a learning model that interests students to participate in teaching and learning activities, student learning outcomes will increase. If implemented properly, learning models can serve as valuable communication tools for teachers to help them convey knowledge to students, thereby achieving learning objectives and improving learning outcomes.

In reality, a large number of educators still use old or conventional learning techniques. When the introduction of subject matter and one-way teaching and learning exchanges become the sole focus of the educational process in schools, the role and function of the instructor become very prominent. Students, on the other hand, only pay attention to the teacher's information or knowledge. The disproportionate condition is the result of this situation. Students become inactive and uncreative compared to their very active teachers. Students have so far only been treated as objects, which hinders their ability to reach their full potential, especially in topics such as Islamic Religious Education, or PAI for short, which demands active participation from students.

To strengthen this reality and make adjustments to the current learning model, the author will use an example of previous material to describe the current condition of student learning outcomes in the subject of Islamic Religious Education. The research will be conducted on students of class VIIII SMP Negeri 2 Sosa. Based on the results of the formative evaluation of the previous material, as many as 7 students obtained advanced qualifications, 5% obtained advanced qualifications, 38% obtained sufficient qualifications, 42% obtained sufficient qualifications, and 15% obtained new qualifications.

Based on the facts above and the classical completion rate of 28%, it can be concluded that the learning outcomes of class VIIII students of SMP Negeri 2 Sosa in the subject of Islamic Religious Education are still low. The use of learning methods that are less able to arouse students' enthusiasm for learning has an impact on this condition. This is because the management system and learning environment needed in each learning model are slightly different. Students with certain learning models may find it easy to accept and understand certain subjects, but other learning models may also be needed that are appropriate to the subject and its quality.

Research is needed to identify the reasons behind the shortcomings in student learning outcomes in order to overcome this problem. The researcher's observation findings indicate that there is a severe lack of students' desire to learn in this field. This is because this learning needs to provide students with direct experience and not just ideas or information that burden them and prevent them from being able to express their creativity and ingenuity. Therefore, the Problem Based Learning (PBL) learning model is another approach that can be used. The purpose of the Problem Based Learning (PBL) learning paradigm is to motivate students to learn by presenting various real-world challenges from their daily lives. Orienting students to the problem, planning their learning, directing individual and group investigations, creating and presenting work products, and assessing and evaluating the problem-solving process are components of the PBL learning paradigm.

### **METHODS**

Observation of learning activities, actions carried out consciously and occurring in the classroom together" is what is meant by classroom action research (CAR) (Arikunto et al., 2019: 3). This research was conducted with the aim of improving classroom learning in order to improve learning outcomes and student process skills. Because it describes the Problem Based Learning (PBL) learning methodology used and the learning outcomes achieved, this research is included in the descriptive research category. The researcher

and sole person in charge of this research is the teacher. Planning, activities, observations, and reflections are part of this research.

Basically, research variables are anything in any form that researchers decide to research so that information is obtained about it, then conclusions are drawn, Sugiyono (2012: 38). The independent variable, also known as the independent variable, and the dependent variable, also known as the dependent variable, are the two variables observed in this study. The PBL learning model, or variable X, is the independent variable of the study, and student learning outcomes, or variable Y, is the dependent variable.

Quantitative and qualitative data are used in this study. Learning outcome tests provide quantitative data. Meanwhile, qualitative data were collected through supervisory observations and explained how learners communicate their level of knowledge, interest, confidence, curiosity, and motivation. The research data were obtained from interview, observation and test techniques.

To find out whether the Learning Target Completion Criteria (KKTP) have been met, an examination of the cognitive test results obtained in the final semester exam (UAS) is carried out. Learning outcomes can be known by conducting descriptive analysis of observation data. If the performance indicators meet the following requirements, then it can be said to be successful: 1) Student learning outcomes can reach an absorption rate of 75% or a score of 75 or more; 2) Teaching and learning activities are carried out at least 85% and obtain observation scores in the good and very good categories, and the percentage of student activity is close to 80%.

#### **RESULTS**

In the initial conditions before the action was taken, the researcher conducted a preliminary study in class VIII of SMPN 2 Sosa on November 9, 2024. The researcher carried out the PAI learning plan in class VIII with the theme, "Believing in the books of Allah: Becoming a Tolerant Generation of Al-Qur'an Lovers" using the lecture and question and answer method, the researcher explained the meaning of Faith in the books of Allah, a brief history of the books of Allah and How to get used to reading the Al-Quran every day. The evaluation tool used to determine the abilities of students in learning is a fill-in test. Then the researcher carried out the learning steps starting from the initial activities, apperception to the final activities of the evaluation implementation, from the learning outcomes of class VIII students of SMPN 2 Sosa showed that many students had not achieved the Learning Objective Achievement Criteria (KKTP) that had been set, namely 75. Of the 7 students, only 2 students (28.5%) got a score above the KKTP, while 5 students (71.5%) got a score below the KKTP.

Previously, the researcher also held a meeting with the principal as the school leader to convey the intent and purpose of the researcher who would conduct Classroom Action Research (CAR) at the school he led. In addition, the researcher also discussed with fellow teachers with the aim of collaborating with the researcher on future CAR activities. The results of the meeting apparently received a fairly positive response from the Principal and fellow teachers by welcoming them by providing support for the intent and purpose of the researcher. Furthermore, the researcher and colleagues discussed the research to be carried out including the research schedule, the classes to be observed, determining the KKTP, and the subject matter to be used as teaching materials and finally it was decided to conduct Classroom Action Research (CAR) in class VIII of SMPN 2 Sosa with a research schedule ranging from early November to the first week of December 2024.

The problems found in pre-cycle learning before the implementation of the PBL learning model were that students had difficulty understanding the subject matter due to lack of motivation and student learning participation. This problem was caused by teacher-centered learning with a lecture method which resulted in a lot of time needed for presentation. The researcher prepared a learning plan related to the predetermined theme, namely, "Believing in the books of Allah: Becoming a Tolerant Generation of Al-

Qur'an Lovers" developing a learning scenario in accordance with the PBL learning syntax, namely 1) Group division for discussion; 2) Guidance in the problem-solving process; and 3) Presentation of group discussion results. The researcher also prepared learning resources and media, developed an assessment instrument format and compiled questions for student evaluation and prepared the implementation of the action.

From the observation in cycle I, the results of the action showed that the learning process went quite well. The researcher who acted as the teacher was able to apply the PBL learning model to teaching. The application was in accordance with the PBL learning syntax, but it was still not effective due to several obstacles, including 1) The attention of some students was still lacking when the teacher demonstrated skills and presented the material; 2) The activeness of students in group activities was not yet optimal; and 3) Some students were not yet able to answer questions from the teacher. Based on these obstacles, the researcher concluded that the implementation of student learning in cycle I was not optimal, thus affecting student learning outcomes, although from the data analysis there was an increase in pre-cycle learning outcomes. The problems that emerged in cycle I will be resolved in cycle II by determining steps for improvement in planning and action.

In Cycle 1, the results of data analysis showed that learning with the Problem Based Learning (PBL) method had a positive impact on improving student learning outcomes. Of the 7 students who participated in the learning, 5 students (71.5%) had achieved the Learning Objective Achievement Criteria (KKTP), while 2 other students were still below the KKTP. The results of observations showed that the majority of students began to be active in the group discussion process and were able to contribute to problem solving, although some students still did not participate optimally. The obstacles faced included the lack of initial understanding of students regarding the material and limited time in solving problems. Although there was an increase in student activity, improvements were needed in the aspect of more intensive guidance for students who were still passive, as well as the provision of concrete examples so that the material was easier to understand. Reflections from this cycle will be used for improvements in Cycle 2, with a focus on increasing active participation and student understanding of basic concepts.

In the second cycle, the teacher made a number of improvements to increase the effectiveness of learning. One important step taken was to strengthen mentoring in group discussions. The teacher was more actively involved in each group, providing more structured guidance and direction so that students could understand their assignments better. In addition, the learning methods applied were more interactive. The teacher used an intensive question and answer approach, motivating students to think critically and express their opinions.

The teacher also provided more opportunities for students to ask questions, both to the teacher and between students, so that the classroom atmosphere became more lively. Students who were previously passive were encouraged to participate more actively by giving awards or praise for each of their efforts. In addition, the teacher provided concrete examples and illustrations that were relevant to everyday life, so that the material was easier for students to understand.

This approach not only helped students understand the material better, but also increased their confidence in the learning process. With these improvements, it is hoped that students will be more enthusiastic in learning and their learning outcomes will improve by the end of the second cycle.

In the implementation stage of the action in the second cycle, the teacher focused on involving students in more question and answer activities to encourage active participation. Questions and answers were carried out in turns, both between students and between students and the teacher, in order to strengthen their understanding of the material being taught. In addition, the teacher ensured that each student had the opportunity to ask or answer questions, so that the involvement of all students in the learning process increased.

The teacher also provided more time for group reflection, where each group was given the opportunity to discuss solutions to the problems they faced during learning. This reflection is important to deepen understanding of the material and train students' ability to think critically and collaborate. In this process, the teacher acts as a facilitator, ensuring that each student is actively involved in the discussion and supports each other to achieve a common solution.

Collaboration is the main focus in the implementation of this action. Students are invited to work together in groups, solve the problems given, and collect various ideas that are useful for the group. Each group is expected to find a solution by discussing and analyzing the problem collectively. With this approach, students are more motivated to participate, learn from each other, and develop teamwork skills.

In the observation stage in the second cycle, there was a significant increase in student participation. Of the total 7 students, 5 students were seen actively involved in various learning activities, especially in group discussions, asking questions, and providing solutions to the problems presented. Compared to the first cycle, this activity shows clear progress, where in the first cycle only 3 students were active.

During the observation, it was seen that students were more confident in expressing their opinions, both in class forums and group discussions. They did not just listen, but also began to dare to ask and refute the opinions of their friends, which showed an increase in understanding and critical thinking skills. Students who previously tended to be passive began to get involved in the learning process and actively participate in question and answer activities.

In addition, the classroom atmosphere became more dynamic and interactive. The teacher also noted that students were better able to work together in groups to find solutions together, so that collaboration between students was more effective. With the increase in student activity, the teacher can see positive developments in students' understanding of the material being taught, as well as an increase in their motivation to learn. This observation indicates that the learning methods and strategies applied in the second cycle succeeded in increasing student engagement and learning outcomes.

In the observation stage in the second cycle, there was a significant increase in student participation. Of the total 7 students, 5 students were seen actively involved in various learning activities, especially in group discussions, asking questions, and providing solutions to the problems presented. Compared to the first cycle, this activity shows clear progress, where in the first cycle only 3 students were active.

During the observation, it was seen that students were more confident in expressing their opinions, both in class forums and group discussions. They did not just listen, but also began to dare to ask and refute the opinions of their friends, which showed an increase in understanding and critical thinking skills. Students who previously tended to be passive began to get involved in the learning process and actively participate in question and answer activities.

In addition, the classroom atmosphere became more dynamic and interactive. The teacher also noted that students were better able to work together in groups to find solutions together, so that collaboration between students was more effective. With the increase in student activity, the teacher can see positive developments in students' understanding of the material being taught, as well as an increase in their motivation to learn. This observation indicates that the learning methods and strategies applied in the second cycle succeeded in increasing student engagement and learning outcomes.

In the reflection stage of the second cycle, the results of observations and tests showed a significant increase in student understanding. The average student score reached 90, indicating that most students were able to understand the material well. This increase was the result of improvements in learning strategies carried out by teachers, such as increasing question and answer activities, increasing assistance in group discussions, and providing more time for group reflection.

Students appeared more active and involved in the learning process, both individually and in groups. They were able to identify the problems faced and collectively find solutions. In addition, the encouragement to ask more questions and provide answers also helped students deepen their understanding of the material being taught. With a more interactive and collaborative classroom atmosphere, students felt more comfortable expressing their opinions and working together.

This reflection shows that the steps taken in the second cycle succeeded in improving the quality of learning. Student understanding is not only measured by higher scores, but also by the way they actively participate in learning. Even though there has been improvement, teachers can still conduct evaluations to further refine teaching methods in the future, such as providing more personalized feedback to students who still need additional guidance.

In Cycle 2, the results of data analysis showed a significant increase compared to Cycle 1. Of the 7 students, 6 students (85.7%) had achieved the Learning Objective Achievement Criteria (KKTP), indicating an increase in student learning completion. The results of observations showed that students were increasingly active in participating in learning, especially in discussing and collaborating to solve the problems given. Students who were previously passive began to be more actively involved, supported by more intensive guidance and the use of more concrete examples during learning. The main obstacle faced in Cycle 1, namely the lack of understanding of the problems given, has been overcome by simplifying the material and adding time for discussion. Students also showed an increase in critical thinking and problem-solving skills. However, there were still 2 students who had not achieved the KKTP, so further attention was needed to ensure their understanding. Overall, the results of Cycle 2 showed the success of the improvement strategies carried out, and the learning targets were almost achieved.

### **DISCUSSION**

The basic problem for a teacher in carrying out teaching and learning activities in the classroom is how his/her ability to provide motivation and arouse students' interest in learning. Lack of motivation and interest in learning will determine students' learning outcomes. For this reason, a good teaching strategy is needed to create a pleasant learning environment for students. So that students do not feel burdened by an obligation to master something that will ultimately make them frustrated to learn. Considering this condition, the researcher who acts as a teacher applies the PBL learning model in teaching and learning activities in the classroom as a research sample to see the extent of students' learning success. The PBL learning model is one of the learning strategies that requires careful preparation and planning in its application. To apply this learning model, a teacher must have a lot of information about the subject matter determined for demonstration materials for students' knowledge and skills, be able to guide and accompany students in implementing activities, be able to direct and attract students' attention to follow each stage of its implementation and be able to provide feedback and draw final conclusions for each activity. Although in its application it is more focused on student activity. Therefore, the teacher's maximum role is needed to motivate, direct, guide, accompany and help students.

Before the implementation of the PBL learning model, the PAI learning outcomes of class VIII students of SMP Negeri 2 Sosa were relatively low according to the learning outcome data obtained after the pre-cycle. Based on these learning outcomes, the researcher sought the main problems faced by students as the cause of their learning outcomes. The information obtained was that they had great difficulty understanding the lesson because it was based on lack of motivation and interest in learning when learning PAI, they were also rarely actively involved in finding information and knowledge. This can be seen from the percentage of learning completion which only reached 28.5%.

In the implementation of the action, the teacher applies learning according to the learning scenario that has been developed. All PBL learning steps can be implemented quite well. The teacher conveys the learning objectives directly and prepares students for the implementation of the next stage, demonstrates and presents information about the subject matter in stages, guides initial training, provides feedback and continues to the next training. Students listen to the teacher's explanation and follow all his/her directions, follow all training given both individually and in groups and ask questions and provide answers if there are problems.

The observations were carried out using observation sheets for teaching and learning activities, student observation sheets, group assessment sheets, assignment sheets, classroom atmosphere sheets and student evaluation sheets. The data obtained from the observation results were then analyzed and discussed by the researcher and supervisor. Based on the results of the observations, it was shown that all teaching and learning activities could run well. The activities of teachers and students in learning were assessed as good on average by the supervisor, but there were still several obstacles faced by the researcher during the implementation of teaching and learning activities.

Some of these obstacles could be anticipated at that time, while other obstacles that could not be resolved were continued to be resolved in the next cycle. These obstacles are caused by factors such as learning methods, learning facilities and the learning environment of students. Some students have inefficient learning methods, coupled with inadequate learning facilities and their surrounding environment that cannot support students to be able to learn. Data on the profession of students' parents shows that most parents are laborers. This allows children to help their parents more, which results in less concentration in learning due to fatigue. In addition to these factors, obstacles can be caused by mental factors of students. For example, some students are still shy, nervous and noisy. The above factors can affect the implementation of PBL learning.

Based on the results of observations, data analysis and reflection in cycle II, it shows that student learning outcomes are very high. The activities of teachers and students in implementing the PBL learning model run smoothly and in accordance with the PBL learning syntax. Students as subjects in this study showed good motivation and interest in learning, they were able to interact with teachers and other students, complete individual and group tasks well, and draw conclusions from each activity. Therefore, researchers and supervisors considered that cycle II was complete. This proves that the PBL learning model can be chosen as an alternative learning model in Islamic Religious Education learning, because it has met the principles of learning. These learning principles must be considered by teachers in implementing learning strategies in order to improve student learning outcomes.

#### **CONCLUSION**

Based on the results of the research that has been carried out through two cycles, it can be concluded several things as follows that the application of the Problem Based Learning Model can improve student learning outcomes in the material "Believing in the Books of Allah" in class VIII of SMP Negeri 2 Sosa. This is indicated by the increase in the percentage of students who completed learning from the initial conditions, cycle I, to cycle II. In the initial conditions, only 28.5% of students achieved the Learning Achievement Criteria (KKTP). After cycle I, the percentage increased to 57%, and in cycle II it increased significantly to 85.7%.

## REFERENCES

Arikunto, S. (2002). Prosedur Penelitian. Bandung: Rineka Cipta.

- Dasopang, M. D., Lubis, A. H., & Dasopang, H. R. (2022). How do Millennial Parents Internalize Islamic Values in Their Early Childhood in the Digital Era? AL-ISHLAH: Jurnal Pendidikan, 14(1), 697–708.
- Dasopang, M. D., Nasution, I. F. A., & Lubis, A. H. (2023). The Role of Religious and Cultural Education as A Resolution of Radicalism Conflict in Sibolga Community. HTS Theological Studies, 79(1), 1–7.
- Fatimah, A., & Maryani, K. (2018). Visual Literasi Media Pembelajaran Buku Cerita Anak. Jurnal Inovasi Teknologi Pendidikan, 5(1), 61–69. https://doi.org/10.21831/jitp.v5i1.16212
- Gogahu, D. G. S., & Prasetyo, T. (2020). Pengembangan Media Pembelajaran Berbasis E-Bookstory untuk Meningkatkan Literasi Membaca Siswa Sekolah Dasar. Jurnal Basicedu, 4(4), 1004–1015.
- Hendrawati, S., Rosidin, U., & Astiani, S. (2020). Perilaku hidup bersih dan sehat (PHBS) siswa/siswi di sekolah menengah pertama negeri (SMPN). Jurnal Perawat Indonesia, 4(1), 295–307. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.32584/jpi.v4i1.454
- Lubis, A. H. (2019). Upaya Peningkatan Hasil Belajar Siswa Sekolah Dasar melalui Model Cooperative Learning Tipe Numered Heads Together. FORUM PAEDAGOGIK, 11(2), 127–143.
- Lubis, A. H. (2023). The Interactive Multimedia Based on Theo-Centric Approach as Learning Media during the Covid-19 Pandemic. JPI (Jurnal Pendidikan Indonesia), 12(2), 210–222.
- Lubis, A. H., & Dasopang, M. D. (2020). Pengembangan Buku Cerita Bergambar Berbasis Augmented Reality untuk Mengakomodasi Generasi Z. Jurnal Pendidikan: Teori, Penelitian, Dan Pengembangan, 5(6), 780–791.
- Lubis, A. H., Dasopang, M. D., Ramadhini, F., & Dalimunthe, E. M. (2022). Augmented Reality Pictorial Storybook: How does It Influence on Elementary School Mathematics Anxiety? Premiere Educandum: Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar Dan Pembelajaran, 12(1), 41–53.
- Lubis, A. H., & Wangid, M. N. (2019). Augmented Reality-assisted Pictorial Storybook: Media to Enhance Discipline Character of Primary School Students. Mimbar Sekolah Dasar, 6(1), 11–20. https://doi.org/10.17509/mimbar-sd.v6i1.16415
- Lubis, A. H., Yusup, F., Dasopang, M. D., & Januariyansah, S. (2021). Effectivity of Interactive Multimedia with Theocentric Approach to the Analytical Thinking Skills of Elementary School Students in Science Learning. Premiere Educandum: Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar Dan Pembelajaran, 11(2), 215–226.
- Manshur, U., & Ramdlani, M. (2019). Media audio visual dalam pembelajaran PAI. Al-Murabbi: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam, 5(1), 1–8.
- Mardhiyah, R. H., Aldriani, S. N. F., Chitta, F., & Zulfikar, M. R. (2021). Pentingnya Keterampilan Belajar di Abad 21 sebagai Tuntutan dalam Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia. Lectura: Jurnal Pendidikan, 12(1), 29–40.
- Ningsih, Y. S., Mulia, M., & Lubis, A. H. (2023). Development of Picture Storybooks with TheoAnthropoEco Centric Approach for Elementary School Students. AL-ISHLAH: Jurnal Pendidikan, 15(2), 1888–1903.
- Nurhidayah, I., Asifah, L., & Rosidin, U. (2021). Pengetahuan , Sikap dan Perilaku Hidup Bersih dan Sehat pada Siswa Sekolah Dasar. 13(1), 61–71. https://doi.org/10.32528/ijhs.v13i1.4864

- Pebtiyanti, I., Ahmad, A., Dzaky, M., Fauziah, S. N., Rendi, & Puspitasari, P. (2023). Peran kurikulum merdeka dalam meningkatkan harmonisasi antara masyarakat dan sekolah. Jurnal Pacu Pendidikan Dasar, 3(1), 269–277. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.22021/pacu.v3i1.411
- Rahman, A., Munandar, S. A., Fitriani, A., Karlina, Y., & Yumriani. (2022). Pengertian Pendidikan, Ilmu Pendidikan dan Unsur-Unsur Pendidikan. Al Urwatul Wutsqa: Kajian Pendidikan Islam, 2(1), 1–8.
- Ricardo, R., & Meilani, R. I. (2017). Impak Minat dan Motivasi Belajar terhadap Hasil Belajar Siswa. Jurnal Pendidikan Manajemen Perkantoran (JPManper), 2(2), 188–201.
- Santi, Undang, & Kasja. (2023). Peran Guru PAI dalam Membentuk Karakter Peserta Didik di Sekolah. Jurnal Pendidikan Tambusai, 7(2), 16078–16084. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.31004/jptam.v7i2.8918
- Sugiyono. (2018). Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif Kualitatif dan R&D. Bandung: Alfabeta.

